



CGS Review of USGS Trinidad Earthquakes

Matthews, Vince to: Bill Leith

09/11/2012 09:28 PM

"Marcia K McNutt", "David Applegate", "Art McGarr", "Bill Ellsworth",
Cc: Nancy Dorsey, "Ellsworth, Stuart", "Onyskiw, Denise", Philip
Dellinger

From: "Matthews, Vince" <Vince.Matthews@state.co.us>

To: "Bill Leith" <wleith@usgs.gov>,

Cc: "Marcia K McNutt" <mcnutt@usgs.gov>, "David Applegate" <applegate@usgs.gov>, "Art McGarr" <mcgarr@usgs.gov>, "Bill Ellsworth" <ellsworth@usgs.gov>, Nancy Dorsey/R6/USEPA/US@EPA, "Ellsworth, Stuart" <Stuart.Ellsworth@state.co.us>, "Onyskiw,

1 attachment



CGS Review of USGS Trinidad.pdf

Bill,

Thank you for the opportunity to review your report to the EPA. I am attaching my detailed comments in a separate PDF. Your rejoinder about Colorado having the largest "documented" injection-induced earthquake is characteristic of much of the attitude that I have heard from the USGS on the Raton Basin earthquake activity.

I find it of more than passing interest that the recently-released, National Research Council Report on induced seismicity made no mention of the Trinidad earthquakes being induced. Yet, they were fully aware of the events because they cited the steps that the Colorado Oil and Gas Conservation Commission and the Colorado Geological Survey have taken to review all new Class II UIC wells for potential, induced seismicity. NRC's Figure S.1 which is captioned in part as, "Sites in the United States and Canada with documented reports of seismicity caused by or likely related to energy development from various energy technologies", shows four sites in Colorado, and sites in twelve other states including Texas, Arkansas, Oklahoma, and Ohio. ***The Raton Basin is notably absent.***

In general, I would say that T. C. Chamberlain's Method of Multiple Working Hypotheses is absent from this research. The single assumption of these USGS researchers that the earthquakes are obviously induced, extends right down to the changing of the Davis and Frohlich questions.

Vince

Vince

Vince Matthews, Ph.D.

State Geologist of Colorado
Director, Colorado Geological Survey
1313 Sherman Street, Room 715
Denver CO 80203

Office: 303-866-2611 X 8340
Cell: 303-882-6580